



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

BOOK REVIEWS

THE ENCYCLOPAEDIA OF RELIGION AND ETHICS.¹

The first volume of the Encyclopaedia was noticed in this REVIEW, Vol. II (1909), pp. 95-99. Since that time five volumes have been issued, coming down to "Hyksos," and five or six more will be required for the rest of the alphabet. As announced in the Preface, the ambition of the editor has been to include everything that falls under the broadest definitions of religion and ethics; as a matter of fact many things are included which have only a remote relevance to either. The articles on "Bards" (Breton, Irish, Welsh), "Arthurian Cycle," "Feinn Cycle," on "Fiction," on the "Drama," are of this kind; it is remarkable that "Drama," which covers, in its ten divisions, all climes and times, has no place for the religious plays of the Christian Middle Ages.

A considerable class of articles deals with the physical and biological sciences: *e.g.*, "Atomic Theory" (Greek, Indian, Mohammedan, Mediaeval and Modern), "Attraction and Repulsion," "Biology," "Environment" (biological), "Evolution" (biological), "Development," "Degeneration," "Atrophy," "Atavism." There are many articles on philosophical subjects, such as "Epistemology," "Continuity," "Cause, Causality," "Certainty" (logical), "Attention," "Forgetfulness," "Beauty," "Form" (aesthetic), besides articles on individual philosophers—Hegel, *e.g.*, claims twenty pages. Economics has its share: *e.g.*, "Consumption," "Distribution"; there are legal articles on "Forgery," and a definition of "Delict." Finally, mention may be made of articles which are written, not on subjects, but on words. Thus the author who undertook to furnish an article on "Emancipation" saw nothing to do but to descant on as many senses and uses of emancipation as he could think of, from the separation of church and state to Ellen Key; with perhaps unconscious humor—the author is a German—the bibliography begins with Münsterberg's *Die Amerikaner*. Many of the articles named are in themselves very good; but an Encyclopaedia of Religion and Ethics is not the place where a reader in search of enlighten-

¹Encyclopaedia of Religion and Ethics. Edited by James Hastings. Vol. II (Arthur to Bunyan), 1910; III (Burial to Confessions), 1911; IV (Confirmation to Drama), 1912; V (Dravidians to Fichte), 1912; VI (Fiction to Hyksos), 1914. Charles Scribner's Sons. Each volume (about 900 pages), \$6.00.

ment on such subjects would look for it, and every library which possesses this work is sure to have the works of reference to which the inquirer would naturally go.

What principle determined the selection of subjects in some fields is not evident. We have articles, for example, on "Cecrops," "Centaur," "Charites," "Danaiids," "Gorgon," "Graiai," "Harpies," but none on Demeter or Dionysus (and no references to the general article on "Greek Religion"); separate articles are given to many places of no especial religious mark, but "Eleusis" receives no notice; the "Camel" has four columns to himself, but the writers have not discovered his religious significance or his moral qualities.

In many cases a subject seems to have been divided on an alphabetical scheme of countries or religions, without considering whether there was anything to put into the pigeon-holes thus provided. Thus, under "Atheism," after a general sketch of antitheistic theories and an article on Buddhist atheism, we come to one on "Atheism (Egyptian)," beginning, "No trace has yet been found of any definite atheistic teaching in Egypt," in the absence of which the author fills a paragraph with some illustrations of a *carpe diem* attitude to life and the hereafter. Thereupon follow a very thin article on atheism among the Greeks and Romans and three short but competent ones on India, which brings us to "Atheism (Jewish)": "Atheism as a system of thought has no place in Judaism, and there is no equivalent for the term in the Hebrew language or literature." The contributor to whom it fell to write on the Mohammedans was not much better off for real atheists, but gives an interesting account of various dualists, skeptics, and agnostics. A more striking example of what this method leads to is the article "Creeds," which has rubrics for the Babylonian and Egyptian religions! *In fugam vacui* the authors write about some of the general religious notions and beliefs of the peoples in question. On the other hand, the author to whom Moslem creeds were assigned confines himself to the profession of faith, and does not even mention the existence of theological creeds in the proper sense.

The plan of the Encyclopaedia makes a great deal of duplication and repetition inevitable, especially between general articles on religious phenomena and articles on particular countries or religions; but this, while it adds to the bulk of the work, is for the convenience of the reader.

It is inevitable that in a work which maps out the field for the first time there should be serious omissions. Thus, there is no

article or entry for "Attributes, Divine," though it is evidently much more closely related to religion than "Attraction and Repulsion," which gets nearly a page, and though the Attribute Controversy is a large and highly significant chapter in the history of mediaeval Moslem and Jewish theology. There is none on "Confession, Auricular"; none on "Chasidism" (or Hasidism), one of the most important movements in modern Judaism, though there is one on the "Hasideans" of Maccabaeae times. Other omissions which I have noted incidentally are, "Bardesanes," "Carvakas," "Chu Hi," "Constantinople," "Dionysius Areopagita," "Dositheus, Dositheans," "Fourier, Fourierism," etc. Under "Druses," we are bidden see "SECTS, Christian," a company in which the Druses will be surprised to find themselves!

The high quality of the individual articles set in the first volume is well maintained. The editor has been singularly successful in enlisting not merely competent but eminent contributors, and in keeping them. And—what does not always follow from great reputations—the authors have done their work honestly and with evident interest. One or two might be named who are plainly tired of saying the same things in lectures and popular series and new encyclopaedias, and their weariness communicates itself to the reader; but such cases are few. The articles move pretty evenly on the plane of the educated, but not specially learned, reader, and the impression of solid learning united with sane judgment which the first volume made is confirmed by its successors.

Of conspicuous excellence are the articles on India—religions, peoples, places, persons. The materials collected by the British government in its various Surveys and Reports, and the co-operation of scholars who have been in this service and add to what is in print intimate personal knowledge, make it possible to treat this field with exceptional thoroughness. The reader will not complain of the resulting disproportion. But he may ask whether China, for example, has been as well provided for as conditions permit. No such question arises about the articles on Mahayana Buddhism, which have fallen into excellent hands (Anesaki, de La Vallée Poussin, Takakusu).

Some articles of conspicuous note in Volume II are: "Aryan Religion" (O. Schrader), "Assam" (Gait), "Bab, Babis" (E. G. Browne), "Berbers, North Africa" (R. Basset), "Bhakti Marga" (Grierson), "Bible in the Church" (E. v. Dobschütz), "Bodhisattva" (Poussin), "Brahmanism" (Jacobi). In Volume III there is a comprehensive article on the "Celts" (J. A. MacCullough). The

article on "Christianity" (Garvie) is written from a dogmatic point of view; the author expressly rejects at the outset the "religious-historical method" (*not* the loud-voiced "religionsgeschichtliche Schule," but the application of historical method to the Christian religion), and in fact the article, so far as it deals with the beginnings of Christianity, is chiefly a controversial discussion of various modern theories (Pfleiderer, Harnack, Loisy, Orr, and others). It is perfectly proper that the dogmatic construction of Christianity should have place in the Encyclopaedia, as Buddhist or Moslem doctrine has; but the reader has a right to expect that it shall also be historically presented, as other religions are; not specifically exempted from the application of historical method on theological or apologetic grounds. The volume contains several long composite articles ("Calendar"—80 pages; "Charity, Almsgiving"; "Charms and Amulets"; "Chastity"; "Circumcision"; "Communion with Deity"). In the first of these, in an excellent presentation of the Jewish Calendar by Poznanski, an inexcusable misprint occurs on p. 117 and is twice repeated on p. 123, by which the Seleucid era is transformed into the "era of the Seljüks"(!), which the Jews are said still to continue to use. American readers will be mildly amused by the conclusion of the article by Dugald Macfadyen on Horace Bushnell; Bushnell's ideas were introduced into English religious thought by Alexander Mackennal and Charles Berry, "but, owing to want of sufficient theological training, the representatives of the monistic tradition have strayed into pantheism." When, "for want of sufficient theological training," a monist takes to straying into pantheism, he is in great danger of keeping on in the same direction, and landing in theism before he knows it!

Volume IV includes extended composite articles on "Cosmogony and Cosmology," "Death and Disposal of the Dead," "Demons and Spirits," "Disease and Medicine," "Divination." The article on "Confucian Religion" is singularly meagre; that on "Covenanters" is longer than "Crusades"—a somewhat provincial estimate of historical dimensions!

In the fifth volume special attention may be called to the article on "Dravidians," particularly the first part (by Crookes). There is a long article on "Dress"; "Dualism," in some sense or other of twoness, is discovered among the American Indians, Egyptians, Jews, and other peoples. "Education," "Ethics and Morality," "Expiation and Atonement," "Family," "Fasting," "Festivals and Fasts," "Fate," are the titles of comprehensive articles, carrying us to all parts of the globe, and distributed among numerous

authors. The article on "Egyptian Religion" (by Petrie) does not attempt much more than a classified inventory of facts about the religion—catalogues of sacred animals and gods, beliefs about the dead and funerary customs, etc.

Volume VI brings, among others, an article on "Fortune" (which is not always properly distinguished from astrological fate); E. F. Scott treats "Gnosticism" soberly—a subject which has on many minds the effect which South is said to have attributed to the Apocalypse. In this part of the alphabet fall also the entries, "God" (composite), "Gospels" (Burkitt), "Greek Religion" (Farnell), "Harranians" (D. S. Margoliouth—somewhat meagre), composite articles on "Health and Gods of Healing," "Hearth and Hearth-Gods," "Heroes and Hero-Gods," "Holiness," "Human Sacrifice." Special mention should be made of W. Crooke's masterly article on "Hinduism."

In conclusion we can only repeat what was said in our notice of the first volume: The *Encyclopaedia of Religion and Ethics* must have a place in every reference library, and is an indispensable tool to every one who undertakes either the study of religious phenomena, or of particular religions, or of the history of religion as a whole. The editorial control will doubtless be firmer as the work proceeds; the prevailing level of the individual contributions is extraordinarily high, and the bibliographies appended to the articles are in general good both in inclusion and exclusion. Instances like Iverach's "Caesarism," in which none of the works of first rank on the subject is mentioned, are conspicuously infrequent.

GEORGE F. MOORE.

HARVARD UNIVERSITY.

ST. PAUL AND THE MYSTERY-RELIGIONS. H. A. A. KENNEDY, D.D., D.Sc. Hodder & Stoughton. 1913. Pp. xviii, 311. \$1.50.

Dr. Kennedy has given us a book which is in many ways important and valuable. As its title shows, it is an attempt to consider the relationship of Pauline theology to the contemporary cults of the Roman Empire. In successive chapters he discusses the influence of Stoicism, Astralism, the Orphic movement, Jewish affinities with the Mystery-religions, the general characteristics of the chief Greek and Oriental cults, Pauline terminology and the central conceptions of Paulinism as compared with those of the Mystery-religions, baptismal rites, and sacramental meals.

As a collection of facts this will be of much use to the theological student, especially so far as it concerns the Mystery-religions rather